

General Plan/Zone Change Analysis

June 12, 2024

Application #: GPZ-4-2024
Applicant: Edge Homes
Address: 3688 South Redwood Road
Request: General plan change from General Commercial to Medium Density Residential and zone change from C-2 to RM
Property Size: 26.26 acres

Edge Homes has submitted a General Plan/zone change application for 9 parcels totaling 26.26 acres located at 3688 South Redwood Road. The property is currently zoned C-2 (General Commercial) with a General Plan designation of General Commercial. The proposed zone is RM (Multiple Unit Dwelling Residential) and the proposed General Plan designation is Medium Density Residential (7 to 12 units/acre).

Surrounding zones include C-2 and RM to the north and south; C-2, RMH (Residential Mobile Home), and RM to the east; and R-1-8 (Single Unit Dwelling Residential, minimum lot size 8,000 sq. ft.) and A (Agriculture, minimum lot size ½ acre) to the west. The attached map shows the surrounding land uses. The subject property is the Redwood Drive-In Theatre which opened in 1948. The property also functions as a swap meet on weekends. The property falls within the South Redwood RDA.

The applicant is proposing a residential development with 308 for sale dwelling units with three different housing types. The proposed density of the project is 11.7 units/acre. The three housing types are 250 2-story townhomes with four different building designs, 40 3-story condos, and 18 single family homes. Additional details on each housing type are provided below. All townhomes and single family homes will have a two-car garage and the condos will have a one-car garage. The attached concept plan and application materials from the applicant provide details on and support for the proposed project.

In reviewing this application, staff suggests that there are two primary questions to answer:

1. Is this the right location for a residential development of this type and density?
2. Assuming the location is appropriate, does the quality of the project further City goals?

These two questions are explored below.

Is this the right location for a residential development of this type and density?

According to the City's zoning ordinance, zone changes to the RM zone can only be considered by the City if the following four conditions are met:

1. For properties without existing Structures which are proposed to be developed, the property must be a minimum of one acre and the Density must not exceed 12 units per acre. For properties with existing Structures proposed to be redeveloped, the property must be a minimum of 20,000 square feet and the Density must not exceed 20 units per acre. For properties that are west of Redwood Road and within one-half mile of the West Valley Central light rail station, the Decker Lake light rail station or the Redwood Junction light rail station, the Density may exceed 20 units per acre;
2. The property shall meet any one of the following four requirements: (i) have access and Frontage on a Street with a planned Right-of-way width of at least 80 feet (for properties under two acres) or 100 feet (for properties two acres or larger) as indicated on the Major Street Plan; (ii) be adjacent to existing multifamily residential development on two sides; or (iii) be located west of Redwood Road and within one-half mile of the West Valley Central light rail station, the Decker Lake light rail station, or the Redwood Junction light rail station; or (iv) if the property is vacant, was vacant as of January 19, 2021, will be an exempt housing development under 24 CFR 100.304 or successor regulation with a density no greater than seven units per acre, and have access and Frontage on a Street with a planned Right-of-way width of at least 80 feet;
3. A Development Agreement must be proposed with the zone change application that addresses Dwelling Unit sizes, exterior materials, architecture, Landscaping, and project Amenities; and
4. A traffic impact study prepared by a registered traffic engineer is required for projects with 100 or more Dwelling Units.

This application meets the first condition in that the property is over 20,000 square feet, includes structures proposed to be redeveloped and has a proposed density below 20 units/acre. For the second condition, the subject property has access and frontage on Redwood Road, which has a planned right-of-way width over 100'. On the third condition, the applicant's development agreement standards are addressed later in this report. For the fourth condition, a traffic impact study was submitted by the applicant and is included with this report. In summary, the traffic impact study recommended that a dedicated southbound right-turn lane be constructed on 1950 West at 3800 South to improve the intersection's level of service (LOS).

While the property is eligible for RM zoning, the City may still deny requests for RM zoning.

The points below may help the Commission answer the first question.

- The subject property is surrounded by a mix of residential uses including townhomes to the north and east, mobile homes to the east, apartments to the south, and single family homes to the west.
- Granger Elementary School is located to the west across the street on 1950 West.
- Between 3500 South and 4100 South, over half of the property that accesses Redwood Road is residential.

- Both 3800 South and 1950 West are predominantly residential streets.
- Redwood Road is currently a 7-lane arterial street that is serviced by UTA bus route 217.
- Average annual daily traffic (AADT) on this segment of Redwood Road was 35,000 in 2022. A 7-lane arterial can handle a traffic volume of 40,000 at a level of service (LOS) C and 46,000 at a LOS D.

At the time this report was submitted, staff had received hundreds of comments via email, voicemail, text, letter, and petition in opposition to this application. The emails and texts are included with this report as a single PDF file. The petition and letter are also included. For the Commission's benefit, the bullet points that follow are staff's attempt to summarize the points raised in the comments.

- The swap meet houses many local vendors. These vendors make their living from selling affordable merchandise every weekend. Removing the drive-in and swap meet would take away their source of income and eliminate a unique and local shopping opportunity.
- The Redwood Drive-In Theatre is a community icon/landmark and one of the few remaining drive-in theaters in Utah.
- Both the drive-in and swap meet are good for the local economy in that they provide jobs and tax revenue.
- The drive-in is nostalgic and provides an inexpensive opportunity for family entertainment.
- There's not a suitable site for another swap meet elsewhere in the City.
- The area doesn't need more high density housing. There are other more appropriate locations for residential development.

Staff believes it is important to point out that, if this application is denied, the property owner could choose to redevelop the property into one or more commercial uses allowed under the C-2 zone without rezoning the property.

Does the quality of the project further City goals?

The City's General Plan includes the goal to "promote higher quality multi-family residential in appropriate locations." To this end, the City's Multi-Unit Residential Design Standards were amended in 2020, 2021, and 2022 to raise the bar on standards for unit sizes, exterior materials, architecture, amenities, landscaping, recreation space, and parking.

The current City code requires requests for the RM zone to be accompanied with a development agreement proposal that addresses dwelling unit sizes, exterior materials, architecture, landscaping and project amenities. Each of these items is addressed below.

Dwelling Unit Sizes

The table below lists unit size information for each different housing unit type. As outlined in the table, all proposed units exceed the required minimum unit sizes. For single unit dwellings, the

City has used development agreements to require sizes that are significantly larger than what is in the City's ordinance, which is limited by State code.

Unit Type	Proposed Finished Floor Area Above Grade (Sq. Ft.)	Proposed Unfinished Basement Area (Sq. Ft.)	Total Area (Sq. Ft.)	# of Bedrooms	# of Bathrooms	Minimum Finished Area Required by Ordinance (Sq. Ft.)
Single Unit Detached*	1,322 - 2,591	1,020 - 1,428	2,650 - 3,810	2 - 5	2 - 3	1,000
Front Load Townhome (Inner Unit)	1,595	685	2,280	3	3	1,400
Front Load Townhome (Outer Unit)	1,618	703	2,321	3	3	1,400
Rear Load Townhome (Inner Unit)	1,705	731	2,436	3	3	1,400
Rear Load Townhome (Outer Unit)	1,647	734	2,381	3	3	1,400
Front Condo	1,352	0	1,352	3	2	1,100
Rear Condo	1,243	0	1,243	3	2	1,100

*The numbers vary depending upon the plan.

While the single unit detached plans all exceed the 1,000 sq. ft. ordinance minimum, staff would recommend a minimum finished floor area above grade of 1,400 sq. ft. to be closer to the townhome sizes and closer to the minimum size established in other development agreements.

Exterior Materials

For materials, the City's Multi-Unit Residential Design Standards state: All multi-unit residential Building exteriors shall be brick, stucco, EIFS, stone, ceramic tile, faux wood composites, architectural metal panels/siding that is used only as a veneer and not as structural sheeting or sheathing, or fiber cement siding. With the exception of brick or stone which may be used on the entire Building exterior, no single material shall comprise more than 60 percent of a Building's exterior. Where stucco, EIFS, ceramic tile, faux wood composites, architectural metal panels/siding or fiber cement siding are used, at least 20 percent of the Building's exterior shall be brick or stone. Corrugated metal and metal panels/siding with exposed fasteners are prohibited on Building exteriors. Wood and vinyl may be used as trim, soffits and/or accent materials only." For single unit dwellings, the City's ordinance no longer specifies required

exterior materials as required in State code.

On all product types, the applicant is proposing a mix of brick, stone, composite siding, and stucco, which are allowed materials. A flyer on the composite siding, referred to as LP Smartside, is included with this report. The condos and the frontload townhomes will meet the required 20 percent brick or stone. While the rearload townhomes will have at least 11 percent brick or stone, these elevations will include two types of composite siding (with one type being more expensive than stone) and will exceed the City's design standards on other features like roof treatments.

Architecture

Based on a preliminary review of the proposed buildings against the City's architectural standards, several issues/questions were identified that were relayed to the applicant. The applicant addressed most of these by making several revisions and is requesting the following two exceptions.

- The ordinance requires a patio or balcony of at least 60 sq. ft. for each townhome and condo unit. The applicant is proposing that two out of the ten units in each condo building would not have a patio or balcony. Of the eight units that would have a patio or balcony, four would be less than 60 square feet.
- Section 7-11-408 requires at least 25% of the primary façade (front) to be fenestration (windows). The applicant is requesting an exception to this standard for the frontload townhome units.

If this application is approved, a more thorough review will be conducted by staff on the elevations submitted for a building permit.

In addition to the exterior features, the applicant has committed to several interior features, such as tankless water heaters, on all housing types.

Landscape

The ordinance addressing landscaping and recreation space requires a total of 50% landscaping and recreation space for developments with a density under 20 dwelling units/acre. According to the applicant, the proposal meets this requirement.

Project Amenities

For a project of this size, the ordinance requires five amenities. The proposed project includes the following six amenities from the ordinance: swimming pool, clubhouse, fitness room, tot lot, sport court, and outdoor covered pavilion with picnic table. The developer has also committed to include a trail corridor that bisects the site internally from west to east to provide walking access to the amenities area.

Other Considerations

Parking

The table below compares the applicant's proposed parking with the standards in the City's ordinance.

Unit Types	Required Garage Sizes	Proposed Garage Sizes	18' Deep Driveway Required	18' Deep Driveway Provided	Parking Stalls Required (Excluding Driveway)	Parking Stalls Provided (Excluding Driveway)
Single Family Homes	3-car*	2-car	Yes	Yes	2.75	2.5**
Townhomes	2-car	2-car	Yes	Yes	2.75	2.5
Condos	1-car	1-car	No	Yes	2	1.5

*A 2-car garage is allowed when there is a 20-foot side yard setback adjacent to the garage and either the 2-car garage is side loaded or the basement of the dwelling with at least a three-quarter basement is finished.

**For some house plans, there will be enough space on the lot to have a 10' setback on the garage side of the house which would allow for an additional parking space to the side of the garage.

The applicant's development agreement proposal includes several reasons as to why, in some instances, the proposed parking is less than the standards in the ordinance. First, the condo units will have driveways that are deep enough to park in. While these driveways don't count toward the minimum required parking, residents will park in them. Second, on-street parking is available on 3800 South and 1950 West and will be available on the streets within the development which will all be public. Based on preliminary feedback from Public Works, they are recommending that on-street parking within the development be prohibited for snow removal and garbage collection.

Planning Commission Study Session Questions

During the Planning Commission study meeting on 6/4, the Commission asked staff several questions that needed follow up. Below are the questions and answers.

- What would the density of the project be if the single family home portion of the project was removed? The current proposed density of the project is 11.7 units/acre (308 units/26.26 acres). If the single family home portion was removed, the project density would be 12.0 units/acre (290 units/24.08 acres).
- What are the City's standards for garage dimensions? For single family homes, Section 7-11-207 states: "The minimum interior dimensions of a garage shall be 20 feet by 30 feet for a three-car garage and 20 feet by 20 feet for a two-car garage." For townhomes,

Section 7-11-404 states: “Townhomes shall have a two-car garage with minimum interior dimensions of 20 feet by 20 feet for each Dwelling Unit. The 20 feet by 20 feet interior garage space shall be clear of obstructions such as stairs, water heaters, or structural appendages like columns.”

- What is the address of the condos developed by Edge Homes in Herriman? The condos are located between Black Locust Way and Cannavale Lane in the Herriman Town Center. As an example, the address of a specific condo building within the development is 5208 West Cannavale Ln.

Fencing

The existing chain link fence along the north side of the property includes wooden slats that are in need of replacement. The developer has committed to replace the existing fence with a 6-foot vinyl fence. The developer has also committed to install either a 4-foot wrought iron fence or 4-foot split rail fence along the east and south sides of the development.

Completion of Improvements

The City has had significant challenges with developers of townhome projects finishing all of the required improvements. Staff recommends that the development agreement include a provision that allows the City to withhold the building permits on the last 30 dwelling units until all of the requirement improvements (curb, gutter, sidewalk, street paving, ADA ramps, survey monuments, street lights, amenities, landscaping, etc.) are installed.

Improvements along 3800 South

As mentioned earlier, the traffic study recommended that a dedicated southbound right-turn lane be constructed on 1950 West at 3800 South to improve the intersection’s level of service (LOS). To accommodate this turn lane, staff recommends that sufficient right-of-way be dedicated to the City. In addition, the Public Works Department is recommending that the integral sidewalk along 3800 South be replaced with a 5-foot park strip and a 5-foot sidewalk to meet current City standards and provide a buffer between pedestrians and roadway traffic.

Staff Alternatives:

1. Approval. This General Plan/zone change application should be approved subject to a development agreement that incorporates the standards proposed by the applicant with the following additions recommended by staff:
 - a. The project shall meet all of the requirements of the Redwood Road Streetscape found in Part 2 of Chapter 7-10 of the Zoning Ordinance along the entire Redwood Road frontage.
 - b. The minimum finished floor area above grade for single unit dwellings shall be 1,400 square feet.

- c. The City may hold the building permits for the last 30 dwelling units until all of the required improvements are installed.
 - d. The developer shall dedicate to the City sufficient right-of-way along 1950 West to accommodate a southbound right-turn lane onto 3800 South. The exact amount of right-of-way dedication shall be determined during the subdivision review process.
 - e. The developer shall replace the integral sidewalk along 3800 South with a 5-foot parkstrip and a 5-foot sidewalk.
2. Approval. This application should be approved subject to the recommendations under Approval option 1 plus the following requirement: With the exception of allowing the single family homes to have a 2-car garage, all other parking requirements in the City's ordinance shall be met.
 3. Continuance. This application should be continued for reasons determined during the public hearing.
 4. Denial. This application should be denied. The C-2 zoning should remain.